

Comments on:

**The Rocky Road to Post-Compulsory Education
in Turkey: Intergenerational Education Mobility**

Ayça Akarçay Gürbüz and Sezgin Polat

Meltem Dayıoğlu

Department of Economics

Middle East Technical University, Ankara

Aim:

Two fold:

1. Estimate the extent of intergenerational transmission
2. Assess its evolution over time

A side interest: Mom's or dad's schooling matter more?

A positive correlation between parents' and children's education, is this causal?

- Motivation:

Talk about positive correlation, change in this correlation over time give examples.

Perhaps link with the equality of opportunity literature.

- The paper can benefit from a clearer exposition of the problem.

What are the reasons for positive correlation?

Define environmental effect

Nature vs. nature (confusion on page 2)

And why are we interested in identifying the mechanism?

More able parents have more able children?

More educated parents have more resources?

Data:

5% sample of 1990 and 2000 censuses.

Outcome of interest = Lower middle-school graduation
(8 years of schooling)

RHS = parental schooling = measured as highest level not grade completed

0, 5, 8, 11, 15. Why assign a zero value to literates?

Unit of analysis: Children aged 16-17 residing with their parents at the time of the survey.

Concern: Are 16-17 years olds a random sample of their population? Non-random loss may be a concern particularly for girls, who tend to marry younger than boys.

Use DHS data to show the magnitude of the loss.

Method:

Instrumental Variables approach – to identify causality.

Instrument parental schooling using province level schooling from external MEB data.

Instrument = primary school enrollment rate at birth-province when parents were 7 yrs old.

E = enrolled primary school pop/ population of school age province level at time t , by sex

What about over-aged children? Repetition? If in Eastern provinces children start late and repeat more often, E will look higher than it actually is for these places.

Claim: page 3 “First, the generations of parents considered in this study have all passed through the same general kind of education system – that is, no substantial educational reforms divide the group under study.”

Compulsory education = primary school but in rural areas it was limited to 3 yrs, urban areas 5 yrs.

1960s reform that increased compulsory school in villages from 3 to 5. (1940s?? Footnote 9)

More background information on the education system and educational outcomes covering 1930-1970s.

Figure 1 and Figure 2 = very strong time trends
Secular trends plus changes in laws.

Birth-province – problems if migrant.
(province when started school is what is relevant)

Rural/urban differences not incorporated but we know this is important.

Generating province level data is a lot of work, is it terribly difficult to generate data at sub-province level?

Data quality – MEB sources?

Is it possible to generate data from Census data. Not enrollment perhaps but % with primary school diploma?

Covariates: No of siblings (if in hh), income missing, urban/rural residence

Validity of the instrument?

Group of children and (younger) parents subject 5 yrs of compulsory schooling. Another group of (older) parents subject to 3/5 yrs of compulsory schooling but their children 5 yrs.

Use of different samples, Table 3 not clear.
Discuss the rationale.

Province level fixed effects – current residence, will not necessarily correspond to where parents went to school unless they are locals.

Results:

First-stage results?

Second-stage results:

- 1) Evidence for causal effect of parental education on child education.
- 2) Intergenerational mobility increased for boys but remained stable for girls
- 3) Greater impact of mother's than father's education.

More discussion on the reasons...less discussion on other covariates. A more focused discussion that can link these three main results would help.

Discuss the magnitude of the effects.

Report predicted probabilities at mean in tables.

If the estimations were to be repeated for urban (rural) children alone, would we observe similar results?